



# The Effect of Grameen Bank Micro-Credit Granting on the Welfare of Pre-Prosperous Women in Indonesia “Case Study of PT. Permodalan Nasional Madani”

Machpudzoh Nur Kholishoh <sup>a++\*</sup>, Marselina <sup>a++</sup>  
and Arivina Ratih <sup>a++</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Faculty of Economics and Business, University of Lampung, Indonesia.

## *Authors' contributions*

*This work was carried out in collaboration among all authors. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.*

## *Article Information*

DOI: 10.9734/AJEBA/2024/v24i31243

## **Open Peer Review History:**

This journal follows the Advanced Open Peer Review policy. Identity of the Reviewers, Editor(s) and additional Reviewers, peer review comments, different versions of the manuscript, comments of the editors, etc are available here: <https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/111970>

**Original Research Article**

**Received: 20/11/2023**  
**Accepted: 26/01/2024**  
**Published: 02/02/2024**

## **ABSTRACT**

This research aims to analyze and determine the influence of Grameen Bank's credit distribution patterns on improving the welfare of underprivileged women in the form of increasing income, increasing sales, and increasing the number of workers among PT customers. Civil National Capital. This research uses primary data which was conducted using questionnaire techniques. The research method used is quantitative with SPSS analysis tools and the mean difference test. The number of samples is 120 PT customers. PNM Cirebon City/Regency. The results of this research include; Providing Grameen Bank loans has an impact on increasing sales, income and business personnel of PT's underprivileged female customers. Civil National Capital.

<sup>++</sup> Master of Economics;

<sup>\*</sup>Corresponding author: E-mail: nurkholishoh21@gmail.com;

*Keywords: Grameen Bank; Pre-prosperous Women; loans; Permodalan Nasional Madani.*

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The poverty experienced by the Indonesian people is multiple poverty, namely poverty that occurs not only poverty for food and clothing, but also poverty for identity, information, access, participation and supervision. Therefore, most Indonesian women are not only economically backward but also have limited access to information, education, politics, health and so on. As described by the ILO (International Labor Organization) [1] in that most of the poor in Indonesia are women, and there is a tendency for an increasing population of women living below the poverty line, as well as growing and acute conditions of poverty in households with female household heads. In addition, poor women suffer more because in most societies they are subject to social values that limit women from improving their economic conditions or enjoying equal access to public services. Women have limited access and control over resources, but on the other hand, with their limitations, women are able to allocate most of their resources to meet the basic needs of their families compared to men. Thus, the greater the resources or income of women, the less likely children are to suffer from malnutrition and be expelled from school. In other words, if successful in overcoming women's poverty, it will have a multiplier and greater impact on improving the quality of human life. The characteristics of poor women are as heads of families, low capacity to generate their own income, limited control over husband's income, limited access to education, decent work in the formal sector, social benefits and job creation programs [2].

Microfinance not only helps the poor to develop in material capital but also in human capital, with better access to health care and education systems, and a general awareness among people of their rights and obligations to society. Seeing these conditions, the Grameen Bank method, which is a rural bank method in Bangladesh, has attracted the world's attention with its innovative and successful group-based credit program for the rural poor. Grameen Bank provides credit and assistance to the poor who are otherwise excluded from the formal credit system due to a lack of material collateral (Khan, 2016). Grameen Bank has replaced material collateral requirements by group responsibility where individual access to credit is determined

by the group's payment behavior. Grameen Bank has created social and financial prerequisites that enable the poor to receive loans based on group performance as well as provide social development inputs to the poor so as to make them individually and socially responsible.

Starting with the development carried out by one of the people in Bangladesh, namely Muhammad Yunus. Muhammad Yunus proved the impact of social entrepreneurship by developing the idea that every individual has unlimited potential, including an entrepreneurial spirit. It is believed that the poverty experienced by the people of Bangladesh is not caused by laziness or lack of skills, but by factors of opportunities and policies that are not paid enough attention to by the government of Bangladesh. At that time Muhammad Yunus succeeded in reducing the problem of poverty through the microfinance institution "Grameen Bank" which he founded with courage and sincerity. Then the concept of Grameen Bank inspired many nations and was practiced in various countries [3].

Marpaung et al. [4] in their research found that the Grameen Bank credit pattern really helps the community in increasing their business with conditions that are not burdensome to its members. Grameen Bank's success as a bank for the poor that addresses women depends on institutional, economic and financial viability and the creation of sustainable benefits for borrowers aimed at reducing poverty.

Based on the Preference Theory presented by Nicholson (1994), consumers express their tastes through transactions in the market, including in purchases or loan selection. This theory reveals that every voluntary loan and paid credit loan can be considered to increase the welfare of the borrower. Loans provided by creditors are expected to improve the debtor's welfare. According to the theory by Gibson (2000), positive impact is the context of organizational behavior that can increase production, quality, efficiency, flexibility, satisfaction, excellence, and development for recipients. If it is linked between loans and welfare, it is hoped that the provision of loans will be able to increase the effectiveness of customers in carrying out their business operations so as to increase income and be able to meet their needs. This will directly affect the level of well-being of individuals and their families.

According to Heubrandner and Skiera (2020) loans that are managed properly and in accordance with usage will have good implications for business sales. Business sales will increase and will directly increase revenue. Increased income will have an impact on the survival of borrowers thereby increasing their welfare. According to Kotler and Armstrong (2012) the positive impact on sales arising from loans from external parties can be measured through several indicators, namely product diversification, promotion, price and place.

In addition to sales, the implications of the loan will affect the level of income as sales increase. Income in this case is net income which means the amount of money left after the company or business actor has paid all costs for running the business (Marpaung, 2018). In this study, revenue is measured by net profit derived from total revenue minus all production costs, operational costs, and unexpected costs. The income variable in this study adopts the indicators presented by Danang (2017), including; increase in operating profit and decrease in operational costs.

The next factor that is suspected of having implications for providing business capital or working capital credit is an increase in the workforce. Based on Law no. 13 of 2003 workforce is everyone who is able to do work to produce goods and/or services both to meet their own needs and for the community. Lending to business units in the market can affect the course of business operational activities so that if the capital is used properly and correctly it will increase income and business scale. Increasing the business scale will direct the business to expand by opening new branches so that it requires additional workers. The addition of this workforce as one of the additional inputs will contribute to an increase in income so as to increase welfare in the end. This is in accordance with research conducted by Moeis et al. (2020), in his research found that capital provided by external parties, whether in the form of loans or grants, if managed according to its designation, will have a positive impact and externality for the business. The increase in capital can be managed in the form of business expansion which will require additional manpower. This additional workforce will have a positive impact by increasing income and profits so that it will increase their welfare.

Some of the factors above explain how business capital loans can have positive implications for

welfare. According to Law No. 11 of 2009 welfare is a condition of fulfilling the material, spiritual and social needs of citizens so that they can live properly and be able to develop themselves so that they can carry out their social functions. This research focuses on the welfare of underprivileged women. According to Genitri (2020) indicators that affect welfare can be measured by several things, including consumption, facilities, health, and living conditions.

PT Permodalan Nasional Madani or abbreviated as PT PNM is a State-Owned Enterprise engaged in the financial business. The company was established based on Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia No. 38 of 1999 dated May 25, 1999 concerning the Participation of the State Capital of the Republic of Indonesia for the Establishment of a Company (Persero) in the Context of Developing Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises. The aims and objectives of the Company are to conduct business in the field of empowering and developing micro, small, medium enterprises and cooperatives by carrying out business activities in Financing Services, Participation, and Management Services and Partnerships. In line with the 9 priority agendas of the Government of the Republic of Indonesia (NAWACITA) which aim to achieve an Indonesia that is politically sovereign, as well as independent in the economic field and has a personality in culture. Currently, many efforts to overcome poverty have been carried out by both government and private institutions in Indonesia by providing services in the form of credit assistance to poor groups, especially in rural areas. As a microfinance institution, PT. PNM in its activities applies the Grameen Bank method in distributing business capital credit assistance to small communities and the informal sector. One of the impacts of this credit distribution for the Indonesian people is that it contributes to reducing poverty in Indonesia.

The company has been running a commercial business since 1999 based on PP No. 38 of 1999. In 2008 the Company made a turn-around of its business by providing direct financing to Micro, Small and SME entrepreneurs through the Micro Capital Service Unit (ULaMM) since August 2008. Starting with 12 ULaMM units as a pilot project, currently the number ULaMM units have become 689 ULaMM service offices. At the end of 2015, the Company expanded its business to underprivileged women with the

product Mekaar (Fostering a Prosperous Family Economy). As of 31 December 2020 and 31 December 2019, the number of PNM Mekaar customers has reached 7,802,806 customers and 6,043,840 customers respectively. Revenue contribution from Mekaar and ULaMM financing to the Company's operating revenues as of December 31, 2020 amounted to 74.45% and 23.33%, respectively.

In line with business development, in 2015, the Company launched a capital financing service for underprivileged women doing Ultra Micro Businesses through Fostering a Prosperous Family Economy (Mekaar). PNM Mekaar is equipped with business assistance and group services. Now, PNM Mekaar is spread across 3,504 Service Offices, covering areas in 5,640 Districts and 422 Regencies/Cities.

In empowering Micro, Small Enterprises (UMK) activities, PNM applies an integrated and sustainable business empowerment approach, namely through the provision of financing facilities in the form of business assistance/training so that MSEs become more effective and efficient in utilizing production facilities and human resources, supported by innovation and networking. partnership, so that it is expected to increase market access and competitiveness of MSEs and provide added value for MSEs.

Based on the previous explanation, PT. Permodalan Nasional Madani (PT. PNM) has a program in the form of product diversification that can serve this segment. PT. PNM (Persero) which is a State-Owned Enterprise (BUMN) and as an extension of the government has a role in poverty alleviation programs. In 2016 PT. PNM launched a product to provide financial support for underprivileged communities called Mekaar (Building a Prosperous Family Economy) which is a capital loan service for underprivileged women.

Currently Mekaar is a superior product owned by PT. PNM with a focus on underprivileged communities, both those who have just started a business, and those who already have a business. In addition to the financial aspects provided to customers, PT. PNM also provides social and intellectual aspects and is part of ongoing empowerment. So this research was conducted based on this phenomenon by looking at the impact of lending from the Grameen Bank pattern from the financial, social and intellectual aspects of customers on improving the welfare of

underprivileged women in Indonesia. The aim of this research is to find out whether loans provided by PT PMN can influence the level of welfare of underprivileged women in Cirebon Regency or not.

## **2. LITERATURE REVIEW, HYPOTHESIS DEVELOPMENT, AND RESEARCH METHODS**

### **2.1 Grameen Bank**

Grameen Bank is a business entity whose main function is as a microfinance bank, which is to provide soft loan services that are distributed to low-income people in rural areas as an effort to empower themselves and earn income, so they are able to create prosperity for themselves and their families. Grameen Bank was first introduced by Muhammad Yunus, a banker from Bangladesh who developed the concept of microcredit, namely the development of small-scale loans for poor entrepreneurs who could not afford to borrow from commercial banks. Yunus uses the "eye of the worm" which is to see poverty from a very close distance.

With a very persistent struggle, Yunus had to interview prospective borrowers who were bridged by a student who sent questions and answers back and forth to Yunus, because meetings between women and men he did not know were prohibited by purdah regulations. Poverty according to Grameen's philosophy is not only caused by a lack of skills, because skills are not directly proportional to one's quality of life. In other words, skills are not a measure of a person's socioeconomic position. Skills also require funds to set it up. While the poor do not have enough funds for it. Even if there is a donation, it does not demand accountability, it even creates dependence, like the Direct Cash Assistance that the government once did. Getting someone out of poverty demands initiative and creativity.

The Grameen Bank project was born in the village of Jobra, Bangladesh, in 1976. In 1983 the Grameen Bank project became a special formal bank under an act passed for creation. It is owned by poor borrowers from the bank who are mostly women. It works especially for them. Borrowers from Grameen Bank currently own 95 percent of the total equity of the bank. The remaining 5 percent is owned by the government. Grameen which means village is used for the name of the bank [5].

Grameen Bank does not require guarantors for its microcredit grants. Because the bank does not want to take any borrower to court in a non-current legal case, it does not oblige the customer to sign a legal instrument. But what makes the difference is Grameen's focus on lending to women. Poor women in Bangladesh have the most vulnerable social position. Although each borrower must belong to five group members, the group is not required to provide collateral for loans to members. The installment responsibility lies solely with the individual borrower, while the central group oversees and supervises everyone who behaves in a responsible manner and will not be a problem repayment. There is no form of joint responsibility, namely group members are not responsible for paying on behalf of a defaulting member.

Grameen Bank in its methodology is almost backwards from conventional banking. Conventional banking is based on the principle that the more you have, the more you can earn. As a result, more than half of the world's population is deprived of the financial services of conventional banking. Conventional banking is based on collateral, Grameen free guarantee system. Grameen Bank started with the belief that credit should be accepted as a human right, and built a system where people with nothing were given the highest priority in obtaining loans. The Grameen methodology does not judge based on people's materials, it is based on people's potential. Grameen believes that all humans, including the poorest, are rich with endless potential. Conventional banks look at what people have earned. Grameen sees the potential that is waiting to be unleashed by people. Overarching the goal of conventional banks is to maximize profits. Grameen Bank's aim is to bring financial services to the poor, especially women and the poorest, helping them to fight poverty, and remain financially profitable. It is a composite goal, which comes from a social and economic vision. Conventional banks focus on men, Grameen gives high priority to women. 97% of Grameen Bank borrowers are women. Grameen Bank works to improve the status of poor women in their families by giving them ownership of assets and ensuring that ownership of houses built with Grameen Bank loans remains with the borrowers, namely women.

## **2.2 Economic Welfare Theory**

Welfare theory in general can be classified into three types, namely classical utilitarian,

neoclassical welfare theory and new contractarian approach [6]. The classical utilitarian approach emphasizes that one's pleasure or satisfaction can be measured and increased. The principle for the individual is to increase as much as possible the level of his welfare, while for society the increase in the welfare of his group is a principle that is held in his life. The neoclassical welfare theory approach explains that the welfare function is a function of all individual satisfactions. Another development in social welfare theory is the emergence of a new contractarian approach which promotes maximum freedom in the life of an individual or a person. The most emphasized thing in this new contractarian approach is that individuals will maximize their freedom to pursue the concept of goods and services without interference.

## **2.3 Poverty Theory**

Poverty is a multidimensional problem because it is related to the inability to access economically, socially, culturally, politically and participate in society. Poverty is a phenomenon where a person is unable to meet basic needs, both food and non-food needs. Alleviating poverty and unequal income distribution is a country's development problem. Amenesi [7] explained that income is one way of indicators to realize or improve people's welfare. The indicators used to determine the level of poverty in an area can be determined on the pre-prosperous family which describes the community's ability to meet basic needs and a place to live.

According to Haryanto [8] an interesting phenomenon for poor households in maintaining their lives with a decent level of living, namely first on the expenditure side, make savings on expenses that are felt to be postponed, expenses related to transportation as much as possible to be avoided or reduced. Second, on the household income side, poor households have forced them to optimize their income through mobilizing their economic resources. This effort is made in an effort to maintain a decent level of welfare or life. However, not all of these efforts are able to maintain a decent level of life.

## **2.4 Family Income Theory**

According to Suroto [9] The theory of income is all receipts either in the form of money or in the form of goods originating from other parties or industrial products which are valued on the basis of an amount of money from the assets that were

in effect at that time. Income is a person's source of income to meet their daily needs and is very important for the survival and livelihood of a person directly or indirectly. Income consists of wages, salaries, rent, profits and is a flow that is measured over a certain period of time, for example: a week, a month, a year or a long period of time. This income stream arises as a result of productive services flowing in the opposite direction to the income stream, namely productive services flowing from the public to the business, which means that income must be obtained from productive activities.

Becker (1985) developed a theory to study the household economic model, where consumption and production activities are not separate and the use of family labor is prioritized. This theory views households as decision makers in production and consumption activities and their relationship with time allocation and income is analyzed simultaneously. The assumptions used in the household economy are time and goods or services are elements of satisfaction, time and goods or services are used as factors of production in the household production function, in consuming household satisfaction is not only determined by goods and services obtained in the market but from various commodities produced by households and finally households act as producers and consumers. Public consumption expenditure is determined by the highest income ever achieved. If income increases, consumption will increase, with a certain proportion. In order to maintain a high level of consumption, by reducing the amount of savings. If income decreases, consumers will reduce their consumption expenditure, with a lower proportion of decrease than the proportion of increase in consumption expenditure if income increases [10]. This condition occurs until the highest level of income that has been achieved is achieved again. Increased income causes increased expenditure for consumption, while the increase in savings is not too large [11].

## **2.5 Labor Theory**

The workforce is residents of working age who are ready to do work, including those who are already working, those who are looking for work, those who go to school and those who take care of the household [12]. The working age set by the Indonesian government is the population aged 15 to 64 years.

Workforce can be classified into several parts. Labor based on work limits can be divided into two; labor force and non-labor force [13]. The labor force is the population who are of productive age based on applicable law including the working and unemployed population. Non-labor force is the population of productive age who are currently carrying out education (school/college), managing the household, and other activities besides working and looking for work. The number of labor force that works is a representation of the availability of jobs in a region. Total production increases along with the increasing availability of jobs. The availability of jobs is one of them determined by the amount of investment which not only increases output but also increases demand for inputs such as labour.

You have mentioned good theories but you should be able to anchor your research on one the theories mentioned.

## **2.6 Hypothesis Development**

The hypothesis of this study is as follows:

1. It is suspected that the provision of credit by the Grameen Bank pattern is able to increase income so that it can improve the welfare of underprivileged women in Indonesia.
2. It is suspected that the granting of credit by the Grameen Bank pattern is able to increase business sales so that it can improve the welfare of underprivileged women in Indonesia.
3. It is suspected that the provision of credit by the Grameen Bank pattern is capable of increasing the number of business workers so that it can improve the welfare of underprivileged women in Indonesia.

It would be better if the hypothesis are stated in null form

## **2.7 Research Methods**

This research is a research with a survey method that aims to see whether the granting of credit by the Grameen Bank scheme is able to increase income, business sales and the workforce of underprivileged women in Indonesia. This study uses data derived from the results of distributing questionnaires to respondents. The research location is in the City/District of Cirebon, West Java. The choice of location is based on the location of the writer's placement at PT. PNM

Cirebon City Branch so as to facilitate the author in conducting research.

The population in this study are all customers of PT PNM Cirebon City/Regency, totaling 127,325 people (updated PT. PNM customer data in July 2022), all of whom are women and fall into the trade economy sector category. If the sample size is too large it will be difficult to get a suitable model, and it is recommended that an appropriate sample size be between 100-200 respondents [14]. So the recommended sampling technique is that the minimum sample size is 5-10 times the indicator variable for each parameter being estimated. In this study, there were 12 indicators multiplied by 10 (12 x 10 = 120). So through the calculation of the sample formulation, a total sample of 120 customers of PT. PNM Cirebon City/Regency.

Indicate the sampling technique adopted by this research.

### 3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

For the sake of clarity, how many questionnaire were retrieved?

Descriptive Analysis.

The results of the analysis on 120 underprivileged female respondents who received loans from PT. PNM has been attached to the attachment list. The data shows that the variables studied obtained the maximum value, minimum value and average value to measure the distribution of data. Besides that, the standard deviation value is also obtained which will show the average deviation of the observation data. The following is a descriptive analysis Table 1.

Based on the results of the descriptive statistics in Table 1, the results show that all variables are

included in the very high category, this is based on the results of the average variable being above four.

#### 3.1 Validity Test

Validity measurement is done using factor analysis. Factor analysis shows that with a significance of 0.05 and is declared valid if the calculated r value is greater than the r table value. The r table value for the number of samples is 120 with a Df value of 118 (N-2) is 0.1793. The results of the validity test on all statements for each variable have rcount greater than rtable (0.1793). So all statement items on all variables are declared valid.

#### 3.2 Reliability Test

After the validity test, the testers then conducted a Reliability Test on each instrument variable X, variable M, and instrument variable Y using the Alpha Cronbach formula with the help of the SPSS program. The results of the reliability test in this study can be seen in the following table:

The reliability test can be carried out jointly on all questions. If the alpha value is > 0.60, then the question item is reliable [15]. Table 2 shows the results that the Cronbach Alpha value of 0.746 is greater than 0.6, so the results are reliable.

#### 3.3 The Impact of Grameen Bank Credit Provisions on Increasing Business Sales of Pre-Prosperous Women

The results of the descriptive statistical analysis also show that the standard deviation value of the sales variable is 0.77. The standard deviation is a reflection of average deviation of the data from the mean [15]. The standard deviation can describe how large

**Table 1. Descriptive analysis results**

Variable	Minnimum	Maximum	Average	Category	Std. Deviation
Walfare	2	5	4,51	Vey High	0,71
Sale	1	5	4,52	Vey High	0,77
Income	2	5	4,65	Vey High	0,62
Labour	3	5	4,47	Vey High	0,71

**Table 2. Reliability test results**

Coefisient Alpha Chronbach	Indicator	Conclusion
0,746	0,6	Reliabel

the variation in the data is, where if the standard deviation value is greater than the mean value, it means that the mean value is a poor representation of the entire data. The mean value of the sales variable is 4.52 which means it is greater than the standard deviation value.

Based on the descriptive statistical results of the sales variable, the minimum value is on a scale of 1 and the maximum is on a scale of 5. The value of 1 is on the promotion indicator, especially the statement "After getting a loan, I do a sales promotion to attract customer interest." and has the smallest mean value among the other statements that is equal to 3.79. These results represent that credit assistance is used by customers (low-income women) not to carry out promotions but to use it to purchase raw materials and business expansion. This is evidenced by the large mean value in the statement "After getting a loan, the products I sell are much more numerous and varied." which means there is an addition of production inputs resulting in varied output.

These results are in line with others research which found that credit provided by third parties can have implications for sales [16]. Loans provided in the form of working capital will be used to purchase production raw materials, increase inventory, and expand market networks which will increase sales volume. Increased sales will have an impact on increasing individual and community income. This increase will have an impact on increasing people's purchasing power and will improve their welfare conditions. Based on the Welfare Theory, states that the government has a responsibility to ensure the survival and welfare of its people [16]. Therefore PT. PNM as one of the BUMNs that represents the government provides assistance in the form of credit given to pre-prosperous women to be put to good use until they reach the point of maximum prosperity. The conclusion from these results is the loan from PT. PNM can have an impact on the sale of debtor businesses (underprivileged women) which will have a direct effect on their level of welfare. Loans or credit provided by PT. PNM is indicated to be used properly and correctly so that it has a good impact on increasing sales of each business from customers. Socialization and education provided by PT. PNM has also succeeded in making customers aware of the importance of support from financial institutions, especially PT. PNM.

### **3.4 The Impact of Grameen Bank Credit Provisions on Increasing Business Income from Pre-Prosperous Women**

The results of the descriptive statistical analysis also show that the standard deviation value of the income variable is 0.62. The standard deviation is a reflection of the average deviation of the data from the mean [15]. The standard deviation can describe how large the variation in the data is, where if the standard deviation value is greater than the mean value, the mean value means a bad representation of the entire data. The mean value of the income variable is 4.65 which means it is greater than the standard deviation value.

Based on the descriptive statistical results of the income variable, the minimum value is on a scale of 2 and the maximum is on a scale of 5. The value of 2 is dominated by the indicator of decreasing operational costs, especially the statement "After getting a loan, the costs for my business have decreased." and has the smallest mean value among the other statements that is equal to 4.55. These results represent that credit assistance has an impact on the profits earned not on the variable costs that arise during the production process. Variable costs that arise are costs that change proportionally with business activities. Variable cost is the sum of the marginal costs over all units produced. Changes in the costs of running a business for pre-prosperous women are more due to market mechanisms that affect input prices from production.

Lending to customers is used properly and correctly as evidenced by the large indicator of increasing operating profit. States that microloans distributed to the public for working capital if used and used properly can have a multiplier effect related to their income [17]. Working capital intended for the purchase of productive goods will have an impact on increasing the income of pre-prosperous women's businesses. This increase in income will have a positive influence on increasing welfare because individuals or communities can meet their needs. In accordance with welfare indicators one of them is an increase in income from the results of his business. The conclusion from these findings is that the credit given by PT. PNM has an impact on business income from customers. The increase in income is indicated by the success of PT's support. PNM in terms of



funding and outreach regarding the importance of business credit for business.

### **3.5 The Impact of Grameen Bank Credit Provisions on the Business Workforce of Pre-Prosperous Women**

The results of the descriptive statistical analysis also show that the standard deviation value of the labor variable is 0.71. The standard deviation is a reflection of the average deviation of the data from the mean [15]. The standard deviation can describe how large the variation in the data is, where if the standard deviation value is greater than the mean value, the mean value means a bad representation of the entire data. The mean value of the labor variable is 4.65 which means it is greater than the standard deviation value.

Based on the results of the descriptive statistics on the labor variable, the minimum score is on a scale of 3 and the maximum is on a scale of 5. The value of 3 is dominated by the indicator for increasing the workforce, especially the statement "After getting a loan, the use of labor increases." and has the smallest mean value among the other statements that is equal to 4.11. These results represent that the credit assistance provided by PT. PNM has no impact on increasing the number of workers in underprivileged women's businesses. Businesses run by underprivileged women around the city of Cirebon are household-scale MSMEs that employ many family members to maintain efficiency and effectiveness in their production. These results are in line with others research which found that lending to the MSME sector had little impact on increasing the workforce in relation to welfare levels [18]. The granting of credit is more intended for additions to production inputs such as raw materials [19].

The largest mean value is in the statement "The workforce used is dominated by individuals of the female sex." with a value of 4.81 this represents that most of the labor used is still carried out by the customer himself to minimize the costs incurred if using additional labor from outside. The utilization of labor from the family circle is also still carried out by these pre-prosperous women entrepreneurs. Utilization of family members is intended to maintain the quality of the products produced and minimize costs [20]. The welfare measure in this study was not affected by the addition of labor due to assistance in the form of loans from PT. PNM.

## **4. CONCLUSION**

Based on the results of data processing and discussion that has been done, this research can be concluded as follows:

1. The provision of grameen bank loans has an impact on increasing business sales from underprivileged women.
2. The granting of grameen bank loans has an impact on increasing the business income of pre-prosperous women.
3. The provision of grameen bank loans does not have an impact on increasing the number of business workers from underprivileged women.

The results of this research have implications for its contribution to poverty alleviation in Indonesia, especially Cirebon Regency. Credit provided by financial institutions can be a factor in improving community welfare. This indicates that other financial institutions must adopt this credit method and program as a financial solution in Indonesia.

## **COMPETING INTERESTS**

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

## **REFERENCES**

1. ILO. Gender and poverty. International Labor Office; 2004.
2. Michael Todaro P. Third World economic development. Jakarta. Publisher: Erlangga. 2000;1.
3. Nurhayati. Social entrepreneurship muhammad yunus Grameen Bank. Journal of Business, Management & Banking. UM Sidoharjo. 2016;2.
4. Marpaung Enny Syafrida et al. The impact of providing Grameen Bank credit on coastal community MSMEs by the Mitra Mina micro coastal economic development Institution Cooperative in Tuban Regency, namely Grameen Bank credit. IPB: Faculty of Economics and Management; 2013.
5. Nanjo Zenji, Kazushiro Yoshinaga. Muhammad Yunus: Creating a World without Poverty. Jakarta. Publisher: Gramedia Pustaka Utama; 2008.
6. Albert M, Hahnel R. Traditional Welfare Theory. 2005;77. Available:www.zmag.org/books/1/html
7. Amnesia Dance. Analysis of factors that influence women's income in poor families

- in Kapal Village, Mengwi District, Badung Regency. Udaya University, Bali; 2010.
8. Haryanto Sugeng. The active role of women in increasing the income of poor households: Case study of women stone breakers in Puncanganak, Tugu Tregalek District. Independent University of Malang;2007.
  9. Suroto. Development strategy and employment opportunity planning. Yogyakarta: Gajah Mada University; 2000.
  10. Algifari Guritno Mangkoesobroto. Macroeconomic Theory. Yogyakarta: STIE YKPN; 1998.
  11. Reksoprayitno Soediyono. Macroeconomics. Yogyakarta. BPPE;2000.
  12. Zenji Nanjo, Kazuhiro Yoshinaga. Muhammad Yunus: Creating a world without poverty. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama; 2008.
  13. Novytha Triana. The role of social capital in improving the welfare of pre-prosperous families in Pallangga District, Gowa Regency. Thesis. Department of development economics, faculty of economics. Makassar Public University; 2019.
  14. Gujarati Damodar. Basic econometrics. Jakarta: Erlangga;2003.
  15. Sugiyono. Quantitative qualitative research methods and R&D. Bandung: Alfabeta; 2007.
  16. Baltagi Share. Econometric analysis of panel data, third edition. John Wiley & Sons;2005.
  17. Herdijono I, Damanik L. The influence of financial attitude, financial knowledge, parental income on financial management behavior. Journal of Theoretical and Applied Management. 2020;09:13-19.
  18. Maldonado Jorge H. Claudio Gonzales-Vega. Impact of microfinance on schooling: Evidence from poor rural households in Bolivia. Journal; 2008.
  19. Asmorowati. The impact of providing macro credit to women (Analysis of the adoption of the Grameen Bank Model in Indonesia. Airlangga University: FISIP;2020.
  20. Hilgert MA, Hogarth JM. Household financial management: The connection between knowledge and behavior. Federal Reserve Bulletin. 2021;309-322.

© 2024 Kholishoh et al.; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

*Peer-review history:*

*The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here:*

<https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/111970>